
SAN JUAN – At-Large: Technology Task Force Working Group Meeting
Wednesday, March 14, 2018 – 09:00 to 10:00 AST
ICANN61 | San Juan, Puerto Rico

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay. Let's test it out. Are the scribes getting the audio now?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: There's no typing going on. If you're on the page.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: It's on mute. Can they hear this now?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: The important thing, Judith, is if you have multiple people in the room that are on the Zoom, they've got to mute or they've got to mute their speakers, at least.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: It's all muted.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We'll get an echo but yeah, the scribe is not getting... All it says is [inaudible] getting your audio from phone line. Nothing.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Oh, because we haven't opened up the line yet, right? We're on Adigo but they're not getting the microphone.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible] switch to another line because otherwise the scribes are going to get the French and Spanish if it's spoken [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Oh, okay. So, yeah. So, we're going to –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And you're muted, Judith.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Unless this meeting will be held in English only. We've got interpretations [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay. So, the issue is we have to switch them to the other line because they only gain the phone line and if we talk in Spanish, they'll get the combination of the French and Spanish, so they have to be on a separate line. Did you get that? Oh, yes.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: That's your business, not mine.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. We are now getting the scribes correctly on our channel.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes, it's working.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: But are you putting it on the screen or how is that working?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I can't put it on the screen for you guys. What I'll do is I'm going to overlay it on the Facebook recording. But otherwise, you've just got to open the webpage if you want to look at it your end.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yeah. That's what we're watching.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Okay. So, I'm just going to [open]. I can't put it on the Zoom. That's just not possible.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay. That's fine. Yeah. Okay. So, I guess we're ready then, right?
Are we ready?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Judith, it's very important [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, exactly. Oh, I'm not presenting. Oh, okay.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: If you've got Zoom, I'm just going to grab Zoom audio just in case. You've got people presenting from Zoom?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We're going to be presenting for this. There's no –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: But is anyone speaking from Zoom?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We'll have – we could be.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: If you guys are running Zoom, [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: You just need to make sure the text [inaudible]

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: [inaudible] for the remote people.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: No, I think we'll be fine. We could hear people. We could hear people. Oh, oh. Mario is going to share the screen and I'm going to present. Mario's just going to put the slides up and he's going to share his screen.

Testing. Can people on Zoom hear me? You took the feed out, though. Okay. I just want to make sure we didn't have feedback loop but we have a fix.

So, it's Judith Hellerstein. I'm Chair of the Technology Task Force. So, today we're changing a little bit from our schedule because the ICANN IT people had to close the Adobe room for today because of some security problems with Adobe, and so we are now through Jolie has set up a feed from ISOC New York has set up a feed for us, and so we're going to be broadcasting technology session today through Zoom.

We also have change in the agenda because of the Adobe problems, the ICANN IT staff are not able to come to the meeting today and do some of their presentations, and get feedback. So this gives us more time to talk about other issues, especially looking at one of the top subprojects here is on conferencing solutions and so we'll talk about that, but we'll start the meeting now.

So, this was the original agenda and we'll discuss what is the next session on there, so let me just get it. So, next slide, please. Next. Yes, Chris?

CHRIS GIFT: I can handle some of the content, if you wish, certainly, on ITI and ODI.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Oh, that would be great. That would be great. So, we won't lose that part of the session. Okay. So, thanks so much, Chris, for offering on that. So, the Technology Task Force evaluates and reviews different technologies and tools that can help the ICANN At-Large community communicate, collaborate, and accomplish their goals and objectives for ICANN activities.

Some examples of these technologies include chat, web conferencing tools, real time transcription, now it's

management, the new information transparency and open data project, or anything helps individual Internet users become more active within ICANN. Next slide, please. The TTF – oh, no. Back one. Thanks.

The TTF is open to anyone in the ICANN community who are interested in ICT and how they can be applied to solve the needs of ICANN At-Large and other ICANN constituencies. We tend to have one or two calls a month. Up there listing is our special work projects and other things that we can [inaudible] and we also have a wiki page. And if anyone is interested in joining the TTF, just e-mail staff@atlarge.icann.org. Next slide, please.

So, maybe Chris will give us a little blurb about the ITI. This has been a focus of us, the Technology Task Force for a while. We're always looking at figuring out since about five years better knowledge management, better [inaudible] to finding information on the website or the wiki. And we've been working with the CIO, Ashwin Rangan, for years on this, and now ICANN is doing a new information transparency proposal to help finding things more.

And it's mostly focus. We want to focus that issue on improving access to ICANN information. So maybe Chris, we can talk about this a little bit.

CHRIS GIFT:

Sure. This is Chris Gift with ICANN Org. Just a first before I start a plug for a session. I believe it's this afternoon on ITI. So, there will be an in-depth discussion around it there. So if you want to learn more about this project, please attend that session and there's going to be quite a bit of detail, from my understanding.

ITI is a significant project within the organization. It is cross-functional in nature in that it is hitting all the departments. It is being run jointly by the Communications Team as well as the Engineering Team.

The goal of the project is pretty much, as you can see in this text up on the screen or on your laptop at home, it's about information transparency. We understand that information is hard to find at ICANN. It is spread across an ecosystem of websites. The content is not always tagged appropriately or, I should say, tagged at all, which makes search sometimes difficult, and it often happens in conversations. Right? There's a thread of discussion that happens across these multiple stakeholder websites.

So really, we're trying to resolve that problem, which has plagued us for many years, and so that's really what it's focused on because transparency is all well and good for the organization but if you can't find the content, even though we may publish it, it's not as transparent as we would like.

So, the goal of this project is addressing those issues I talked about, it's really about creating the foundation for the years to come. So it involves everybody in terms of taking their content, looking at the content, removing old content that's not appropriate. We're not going to delete anything, it'll be archived. Nonetheless, removing old content or content that is inaccurate and gives people the wrong impression or wrong understanding of what's happening, moving it to an archive, an appropriate place, and then obviously giving a central part of this is creating a document management repository as well as the processes necessary to manage content internally appropriately.

All of that will end up – the end goal of all of this is this will actually be a new website. All of this will be surfaced and the content will be easier to find. Any questions about that before I jump into ODI?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: One minute, Chris. We are trying to figure out how to get link to phone bridge in to the Zoom. Mario, is it possible that we can dial the Adigo into the Zoom?

MARIO ALEMAN: We can dial in to the conference room that [we made an ID] in Zoom. We were trying to connect – actually you're routed to the

rest of the meeting but we're still trying to find the best way to do it. Let me see if we can connect to the audio bridge and that'll be better.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thank you so much. I think maybe, Chris, did you want to finish the talk about basically what the purpose of it, how it will help us find data and what the purpose is? Because I understand it's only going to be right now on the website and not where most of our content relies on the wiki, and if you could talk a little bit about how this will help us find data.

CHRIS GIFT: Yeah. Your understanding is correct. So, as I mentioned earlier, the problem is across an ecosystem of websites. It's just not ICANN.org content. Content appears in the wiki, appears on ALAC, it appears on all these various websites. So, we can't solve that all at once. It's a big bang thing, which we need to tackle bit by bit.

So, the first one we're trying to tackle is ICANN.org, which still has a preponderance of content, and so that's the first thing that is being tackled. After that, all the subsequent websites within the ecosystem will be tackled in the same manner and brought

in under that umbrella, that document management system, as well as website.

So, the plan is to really have to tighten up the ecosystem so that documents are managed in similar ways, tagged in similar ways, so that again, finding content is easier for everybody in the long run.

So, in the short run, it's going to help you if you are looking for content on ICANN.org. If you are looking for content on the wiki, it is not going to help you. Right? Nor will it help you if you are searching for content on At-Large. We'll continue to use the search bar at At-Large. So, yeah.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much, Chris. So, on the slide deck, there's a little information about the ITI project. And this is sort of what they're trying to do and we will work on this later. Okay, yeah. Alfredo, we're trying to resolve the issue and get Adigo dialed in to the Zoom chat because that used to be the best way.

Okay. Next slide.

CHRIS GIFT:

It's just a continuation of the ITI project, I think. If you go to the next slide. You're already on the next slide. More information about it. So, ODI. Open Data Initiative.

As a slide there says they share similar goals, but that's about all they share in terms of what they intend to do. Yes, it is about information transparency but so for many years, we've talked about open data. For those of you who know, open data, this is redundant, but for those of you who don't, it's just about providing data in a machine-readable format so that people can use the data, the underlying data, for their own research purposes and extrapolate information themselves.

By that, we mean frequently we publish reports and those reports extrapolate conclusions and so on and information from an underlying dataset. We want people to be able to draw their own conclusions from that original dataset, and that's open data. It's been around for a long time.

ICANN is beginning their own initiative in that area or has begun its own initiative, has been working on it for a while, and so our intent is to, again, for transparency purposes, begin to publish datasets and make them available to people to do what they want with it.

I don't know that there's much to share. I don't think I have anything on timelines. I know there's a couple of datasets we'll

be launching soon. I don't want to quote a timeline because I'm not exactly positive. This initiative is being run by the Chief Technology – CTO's office, so David Conrad and his team are running this project with support from others. Any questions on this one?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks, Chris, so much. I don't know if anyone has any questions here or in the room. Sebastien, yes, go ahead.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Well, I'm going to speak in French to add to the complexity of the day. That's okay, no worries. I will speak in English as I am forced. I am Sebastien Bachollet. Happy to talk in English. No worries.

Yeah. I think it's very important project and I have the impression that it may be also good that within the ICANN so-called organization, there are some shared data and open data initiative. Yesterday afternoon, I was at the presentation about [health] indicator and I got the impression that some of the data could have been very useful or could be very useful for the people in charge of the KSK rollover. Therefore, I try to ask if they are talking to each other and seems that it's not really the case.

Therefore, I think if we open the data and that will be great, as much as we can, we need also to be sure that it's shared. And the other point I want to make that we can consider today that we have opened the data about the finance of ICANN, but who can really get into that understand and use them? Then the goal is good. We have to be very careful the way it's done. I used to be an engineer but I am always in trouble when something technical is just done by technical people.

It's always a risk as that it will not work for what really we need as users of the data of the ones who want to look at those data. It's just a warning and I am not waiting for any answer from Chris about that but, of course, if you want to comment, I will be happy. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much, Sebastien. Hopefully, we'll get an answer to that, but we also, I'm told on the Zoom chat that we're having multiple languages. The Zoom chat and – yeah, so we'll try. Thanks so much. We are trying multiple things in an effort to get audio out to the Zoom channel. Okay.

I think also I don't know if any – oh, Satish, you had a hand up.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Judith. I had a comment on or a question, rather, on Chris's presentation on open data. I think it's a very significant initiative from ICANN side and many of us from civil society are looking to this initiative to as was mentioned, to use this data in our own research. What I'd like to know is what is a license that the data is accompanied by. Is it a permissive license that permits anyone to do anything with the data or is it a restrictive license? Thank you.

CHRIS GIFT: That's an excellent question and it's permissive. It'll be completely open. People can do whatever they want with it. I'm not sure the exact what the commons license they're going to use exactly but I know it'll be very permissive.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Chris, thanks so much for your comment. We are still trying to figure out the audio thing but we will move on to the next slide. So, we have several different projects that are going on. One of these is one that we had submitted last year as a special budget, and so we wanted to follow up on it, and I believe Laura Bengford is on the Adobe bridge, but what we've been having [inaudible] some of the policy issues that we've been finding that there's no real way for At-Large in At-Large for users to track what policies they put in.

This is an older snapshot from the At-Large website. We were looking at different, trying to figure out different tracking mechanisms and how if a user puts in a comment that we could track that and so we could have our own tabulation of what users in the different RALOs are submitting public comments, how many public comments we're submitting, there's no really easy way of doing this now because it all has to be done manually as well as on the common field, the database is not requesting people to stay – as a required field the constituency, and so it's difficult for tracking. People would have to go in manually and actually track manually and write down who the proposals are. Next slide, please.

So, this is still a comment from what we found, the details of what we're looking for. Next slide.

This is some of the recommendation, some of the work that we've been doing on policy tracking. But as you see, the text of the PDFs are not indexed, limiting the ability of searches for people to look who are the penholders. But possibly this also since I believe this is on the website and not on the wiki, in which case, it may fall under the IDI and maybe Chris can comment on that type of thing, since this is probably on the website and not on the wiki.

CHRIS GIFT: You're losing me. I was looking for your... I was in the process of looking in the advice registry or logging in to the advice registry to see the status of this particular advice. So, I'm sorry. What was the question about the wiki? What would show up on the wiki? Would your advice show up on the wiki?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: No. The question is the information transparency proposal is only going to be looking to help find data on the website. Are the policy comments that people are putting in, is that on the wiki or is that going to be on the website? In which case, would that enable some of our issues to get resolved because PDF documents will be tagged and be readable as opposed to the search engines cannot figure out what's in them?

CHRIS GIFT: So, there's a separate project, which we have had ongoing, which is called the Advice Request Registry. So, that is a mechanism that we've – it's a process plus a tool that is internally visible. Yeah. It's internally used to track advice to the board. So, it follows basically that website, that link, if you go to that link, features.icann.org board advice. Yeah. There you go.

So, that's the only... Move along. Nothing to see here. I'm not sure why that is happening because I'm looking at it right now.

No. It's the right link. Anyway, so there is an internal tool that allows us to look advice, it track the advice throughout its life cycle within ICANN and within the board.

We are looking to make that more and more public, so that people can see not just the latest advice, but where things are and the history of advice. It's just one thing we have to do one thing at a time. That will be part of the ITI, so more fuller view into that advice tracker will be visible within ITI, so you will be able to search for comments and policy comments and policy advice and get a better view of what's happening across just not only for you, but for the rest of the organization.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much, Chris Gift, and also, I understand we also have Laura Bengford on the phone and maybe Laura can tell us, give us an update on some of the policy tracking features and when this aspect that we were looking at in policy tracking, because what we are really looking for is are we keeping ask what policies have our ALSes been working on and then we would like to track that and report that and get more of them to be working on different policy advices, but if people submit different comments on ICANN proposals separately, there is no real way of tracking it now. There's no way of scraping the data from who submitted the public comments and identifying each one by the

constituency. And then that will make much easier for a search engine or for something to actually help us categorize okay.

Like, for example, when we had the Fellowship comment period, numerous At-Large people commented on that, submitted separate comments, but without... So manually writing down who wrote the comments. There was no way of compiling automated list.

We know who does ALAC comments but if people do separate comments, if we tell people this is something you may be interested, an they post a separate comment on to the tracking document, there isn't a way of automating that and creating a list.

And maybe Laura, if Chris is not also there, can address this. And I know Laura's on the line. Laura, can you address this?

LAURA BENGFORD: Yes, I can. Can you hear me okay?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, this is perfect.

LAURA BENGFORD: Okay, thank you. There's a little bit of echo on my end, so I'll go slow and see [how it goes]. Yes. So, let me first address the

comment that you made, Judith, regarding tracking the constituencies and other folks that may have [inaudible] public comment process.

We talked about in our last meeting a temporary or interim proposal where we could start tracking additional data, such the penholder, and this can be accommodated in small maintenance update so we can track that on the actual advice statement that's on the At-Large website. We'll need to think about how we can involve or capture the additional contributors from the ALSes or RALOs or constituencies as part of that response back to public comment but maybe it's possible as part of this small maintenance update to look at further data that we can track in the At-Large website so that the ITI work and the action registry tracker that Chris spoke about, when that is done, we can connect pieces a little bit better.

So, as Chris mentioned, we do have the internal pieces of the [inaudible] system being developed now, and so we do have to that database, which is good, and it does allow the policy support staff to access the database and very easily update each advice statement on the website with an activity and a link to the board resolution, if applicable, or any other implementation activity.

Those are my updates and we do plan to look at the maintenance update on that [inaudible] and adding the additional search for the penholder with this [inaudible] and maybe we could talk a little bit more about the requirement to add some of the other members, so that will be ready when we get to the ITI and search capabilities.

So, that is my update. Is there any questions or discussion?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. We do have questions. Glenn McKnight, you have the floor.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Hi, Laura. When we suggested this idea back in ATLAS II in 2015, and two years ago, when we proposed this to the TTF, we were expecting to see some kind of movement on this that we can go back to our constituency and give them graphically a snapshot on where we are. There's so much pressure on us to provide metrics in terms of what we're doing and one of the key things, as Judith has mentioned, is policy comments.

So, can you give us any timeline when we'll see something? And number two, we've said again and again, at least three meetings, we said when are you going to consult with us to give any of our perspective. And why we wrote this proposal in the

first place and actually get our feedback to you and whether you're going in the right direction. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much for your question. Laura, do you have any updates to provide to Glenn?

LAURA BENGFORD: Yes. Thank you, Glenn. There's two things regarding the [inaudible] that you mentioned. I think the first part is the consultation on the larger part of the ITI project that [inaudible] spoke about earlier. My understanding is that the process of doing interviews with various community members is underway. It is in the very early stages of that and we can follow up and find out when and how At-Large is scheduled for a consultation.

And the second part regarding the interim changes, which we spoke about in the last TTF meeting I believe last month, I think that can help inform the consultation, as well. We also had [Leann] [inaudible] Technology Task Force a couple meetings as well and she is leading the ARR project and I think is the appropriate person to consult in conjunction with the ARR project to make sure that that input is received.

So, I think maybe there's an action item here for us to come back and make sure [inaudible] one of the [inaudible] meetings, if that's okay.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Laura, thanks so much for that. Glenn has a follow-up. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I'm sorry, Laura. I have not been consulted. I really don't know anyone else in this room. I'd be curious if anyone else in this room has been consulted on this, so I know Olivier is here and Sarah and stuff. I don't know. Has anyone been consulted on this? Are you saying you're talking to community members? Who at At-Large have you talked to?

LAURA BENGFORD: Glenn, the ITI effort has a number of interviews that they're talking to community members. I don't know in this moment who all those members are but I can certainly get back to who from At-Large is part of that effort.

CHRIS GIFT: I'm going to jump in, as well. Just to reiterate what's she's saying, the ITI is going to redo the public comment process.

They're not going to change the process but they're going to redo the tools. Because right now the back end, as I think most of you know, is a LISTSERV, right? Is a mailman, which aggregates the public comments and it's impossible to scrape and so on.

All that, from my understanding, is being replaced by something that will be far more visible to everybody. They don't know what they're going to do yet, from my understanding, because we're still very early in the project. I just know that that's their intent.

So, what I think we ought to do is put you in touch with the right ITI folks because they're running that portion of it, and then I think you can then give them your input on what is it that you want to see.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I've suggested this numerous times [to Erin] shepherding process for policies, which is fantastic process of tracking and shepherding. It's a great process and that's something to emulate, and I'm sure the other RIRs do it similar.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Glenn, thanks so much. We are running out of time on this topic. Olivier, quick comment.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Judith. So, just a quick bit of history here. So, the At-Large Summit yielded a number of recommendations, of which one of them some kind of way of system for the At-Large community to be able to meaningfully put together statements and so on, and we worked on a policy management process system internally. We still are far from having a finished set of blueprints and so on, but that's what we've been working on in our community.

Now, aside from this, totally independently from this, ICANN has also made some changes and now the ITI, the new initiative or the document management system, etc., is something that was presented to us a couple of days ago. I think it was on Sunday, if I recall correctly, and there's going to be some significant amount of funding for this.

But that's specifically for the public commenting periods ICANN-wide, not specific to this community here. How our system will interface with the overall ITI system, we're not quite sure yet, as Chris Gift said, they're still working on the kind of architecture that we'll be using. However, I think it would be important for our community and the Technology Task Force specifically to track very closely what's going on with this ITI project, ICANN-

wide project, and work on our system and see how we can interface our system, our future system, with the ITI system.

I would like to add, finally, that of course if we were to develop our own system, we would have to ask for funding for extra funding request in the future, we had spoken to Ashwin Rangan, the CTO, the CIO, a number of times, and he's well aware that at some point, we might be able to send him these details. But with the current ICANN freeze on the budget, should we call it this way, it is not assured that we would have our project funded. So, it would suddenly be good if we were to engage proactively with ICANN as they are developing their own system, so as to have something that at least serves our community and is not something that goes completely against the way that we work. Thank you.

CHRIS GIFT:

So, I'll take an action item to ensure that maybe Glenn and yourself are plugged in to the right people in the ITI project, and we'll get back to you within the next few days about that. Maybe even this afternoon. I'll try to take care of it now.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much, Chris. I greatly appreciate that. This has been one of our main issues going back five years about working on

how better track our efforts on policy. So, we're going to skip in front of a couple of slides and so we can go on to our next special project.

Okay. So, Satish, do you want to present these slides?

SATISH BABU: I suggest you go ahead. I'll come in for the Zoom part.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay. Thanks so much. Okay. One of our main projects is a review of conferencing solutions. So, basically, we have a subproject that is working on by Justine Chew, Satish Babu, and Jolie Macfie and some others.

We've, over the years, looked at a whole range of different conferencing solutions and we tried to figure out, we've created – upon the advice of ICANN IT, we created a list of desired features that we would need, and also in regards to looking at another platform besides Adobe Connect, what communities are using and what kind of alternatives are out there. This is a continually growing list of features because although we may use only some features, other constituencies use other features and it'll be very difficult for any IT organization to have two different conferencing programs running at the same time. So, that's also another issue. Next slide, please.

So, this is just a little history of what we've looked at. For instance, we also have done, over the years, a series of special projects, special budget opportunities, and we looked at other products. We've looked at Lucid Meetings, we looked at Jitty, we extensively looked at Meetecho, which is used by the IETF. But in every single one we looked at, it did not have the features we needed in Adobe, we needed in conferencing solutions. Satish will be presenting on another one, Zoom.

And additionally, Mark and Sarah [inaudible] have told us they've been looking at other ones that other multilateral institutions are using, but none of them work for us. Next slide, please.

We'll talk about this shortly. They are number of connectivity, when we from Adobe to a different hosted platform, in an effort to get better use of Adobe and a better control over the different feature sets that Adobe offers, ICANN moved to a different vendor. That opened up a whole new can of worms and we've had a lot of different problems, and this is going to be a part of another subproject that Dina is working on.

As Adobe is Flash-based, we continually have problems with Flash solutions, and we've come up with different solutions to them. Next slide, please.

Oh, so this is a chart that shows some of our feature set that we're looking for. And we have to additionally add to this feature set because in talking with Mark and Sarah, found out that other constituencies have two documents in Adobe Connect at the same time from different places, so there was a need for a conferencing solution to add not just one screen share, but multiple screen sharing at the same time, so multiple documents, which means multiple screen sharing. So, it's very difficult to find one software that meets every single need of all the constituencies but we continue to look for one and we'll be testing Zoom later. Next slide, please.

So, these are some of the different challenges we have and the solutions we've tested. In the interest of time, because we spent a lot more time on the policy, we're just going to quickly skip over these and feel free to look at these later on. Next slide, please.

This, as I mentioned, we made suggestions in terms of alternate calls, and we are always researching other solutions. Satish and his team are going to be looking at Zoom and talking about Zoom. We are using Zoom today because of the inability to have audio stream for Adobe, but we are looking in some of the... What may be possible is in some smaller groups of testing out Zoom and having it, one of the features that we like most about this is that it's available in a low-bandwidth environment. Many

of our users within At-Large don't have a lot of bandwidth and Adobe is a huge bandwidth hog because it has so many features that it needs support, and so going on you need a significant amount of bandwidth, which is often not available. Zoom works really well in low bandwidths. Next slide, please.

So, Satish, maybe you want to go now.

SATISH BABU:

Thank you, Judith. Continuing from where Judith left, if you look at Adobe Flash on Wikipedia, the first line says this is a dedicated multimedia platform. So, for the whole world, Adobe flash is replicated but for various historic reasons, we are still forging ahead using Flash. It is inevitable that things will come to a problem sometime in the future, so it is important that we look for alternate solutions and Zoom is a solution that several of us sitting around the table use on a periodic basis because this is the main tool that ISOC uses.

It's a very lightweight tool and it's got screen sharing as well as chat. It works well on mid to low bandwidth situations. It is fully accessible. I see a mail list now in the list which talks about difficulties for disabled people accessing Adobe Connect.

It is offered on multiple platforms, iOS, Android, Mac, PC, and Linux. I use Linux version. Usually, Linux versions have some issues but this one works perfectly well.

It does not have... There is a feedback in the video. It does not have some fancy features. For example, voting polls and so on. I'm sure whether this can be retrofitted. Maybe there are some plugins. This I have not been able to establish.

The basic licenses are free up to 40 minutes. They are completely unencumbered. We can use the chat and every other feature that exists. They are fully functional up to 40 minutes. This is the unpaid version. The pro licenses, there are multiple license categories. They have additional features, including offline chat.

I've been told that one of the requirements that we have is that we want it just for chat. It's like Skype on chat that we are using exclusively. So, the pro versions do provide for that. Next, please.

Now, unlike Adobe Connect, Zoom does not depend on Flash, but it does require one time download of an app or an application, depending on your platform. It's a one-time load. The call recording can be automated. Business accounts have an interesting feature. The entire audio can be transcribed

automatically. This is an experimental feature and available on the cloud version of Zoom.

The captioning part seem to work well. I've not... This is what I read. I think Judith has added this on. Separate room option for smaller group discussions, which can be the merged. In summary, I would like to state that Zoom appears to be a very viable alternative to about 80% to 90% of Adobe Connect features that we use. It does probably lack some of the remaining 10% of features, but has other advantages, especially the bandwidth demand, which is much more from At-Large end user perspective, it is definitely more friendly to bandwidth-challenged communities and individuals. Thank you very much.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much, Satish, for that description. We're asking if we can get a few more minutes in interpreter time, and so hopefully we can. But I want to turn it... Seun, you have a question. Can you make it quick?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Yeah, thank you. Not a question but a comment. Yeah, Zoom is very good tool. I just wanted to note to Satish that there's actually a web version for Zoom, even though some of the features may not all be there, but all the basic features required

is included. So, you don't always have to download the app, you can use it direct on the web.

We use it in AFRINIC, as well, for our meetings, so I think we should look at using it, testing it for that. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Seun, thanks so much for that. Gisella has a quick thing.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you, Judith. We can have maximum 10 minutes more. Interpretation will then be cut off. We only have one person on Spanish. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Gisella, thanks so much for that. Abdeldjalil.

ABDELDJALIL BACHAR BONG: Thank you very much. I'm going to speak in French. Thank you very much. So, in order to find a solution for those conference tools, I think ICANN org could have a budget in collaboration with the IT department in order to develop a product only for ICANN proprietary solution that would be much better now using Adobe or Zoom but long-term, I think that maybe ICANN could. That would make sense financially. I believe, in a couple of years, maybe we can have our own

solution with our own capabilities. That would be a very good idea. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Chris, we'll pass that on Chris and he can pass it on to his IT staff. Alfredo.

ALFREDO CALDERON: Yes. Actually, I couldn't hear what our colleague said in French but I just want to add that the Technology Task Force, since I started collaborating with Betsy Andrews in the ICANN Learn platform, that we keep in mind that the features for the conferencing platform that we decide to use should complement what Tijani does in the At-Large Capacity Building Program or Initiative so that we can have one tool for all those activities. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much. We'll go to Chris for a quick response.

CHRIS GIFT: Thank you. This is Chris Gift with ICANN org. Thank you for the suggestion that we should look at building something. I can respond right away for the departments. Although I'll take it back. I'll give you the initial response and the answer will

probably be that's highly unlikely. While no tools are perfect out there, there are enough that should be able to meet our need. And not only that, but internally we are very, very stretched with a lot of projects, so it's highly unlikely to happen. But I'll take it back. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dina.

DINA SOLVEIG JALKANEN: Creating an [inaudible] tool for ICANN is nowhere short of running a software company. And for the record, I would oppose a proprietary solution created only for the needs of ICANN. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Satish.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Judith. We would need some more volunteers to join this group to identify the tool. I already have some indications from Harold [inaudible] that he would like. Seun has agreed, Sarah has agreed. So, anyone else is welcome to join this group so that we can test out these tools. Thank you very much.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay. Thanks so much. Gisella. Okay, next. Sarah, I'm going to give it to you to talk about the team that you were doing. Sarah's on a team with Dustin Phillips in redesigning the ICANN – the TTF wiki page.

SARAH KIDEN: Thank you, Judith. Just show the slide that has the redesign page, please. I would like to thank Dustin Phillips for leading this process and to thank the team, Dev, Billy, Mario from staff for doing this. So, what we basically did was to just redesign the Technology Task Force page so that it's easy for somebody to find information.

If you notice that most of our pages have information all over the place. We have a link at the top of the page that shows a brief description how to get involved or who to contact, and then we put all our monthly reports in one place. When you click actually any of those links, it will take you to the corresponding place on the page.

So, the monthly report section has all our monthly reports, but we show like two or three of them. Then you can click on that link to go to additional information. Then we have action items and all other information, but basically, it's just to group information and put it together so that it's easy for anybody to find it.

If you have comments, if you have any feedback, or if you have anything to make it look better, we would appreciate that. Thank you very much.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Sarah, thanks so much. I think was Dev, is your hand up? I couldn't really see the hands up, but if people from Zoom want to speak, please do. Okay. Whose hand is... Mario, could you tell me whose hand is up?

MARIO ALEMAN: Thank you. I was just basically reading through the chat and it seems it was from Satish or Dev, just wanted to confirm, but –

SATISH BABU: That was to highlight where the raised hands feature was in Zoom.

MARIO ALEMAN: Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much. Okay. Next slide.

Okay. So, we've discussed a little bit about the Adobe Connect [inaudible] channels and the problem with screen sharing, and

we only have five minutes left of Spanish, so I'm just going to skip around and you can see these.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Judith, just a quick thing. Jolie wanted to speak but I think that the Adobe Connect is not patched on to the system, is it?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: It is. Jolie, can you speak? We don't hear you, Jolie. Let me turn in... Can we hear you now, Jolie? Turn on. Oh.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: No, we can't hear you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay. Sorry about that. Okay. So, if you could put it in chat and then we could then read it.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Jolie has said his comments are in the chat.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Oh, great. So, we'll have this recorded and I'll save the chat. And then that way, we will be able to have them answered. We only have five minutes left. Next slide.

Okay. So, as you see here, we've created the page and we worked on creating another subteam to handle some connectivity issues and to make things more user-friendly.

Dina, do you want to – Dina's heading up team and if there's other people who are interested in joining her, please do. Would you like to present or should I? Okay.

So, we have created a page on Adobe Connect to track these connectivity issues, but in our efforts to be more proactive, we're working on a new subproject that Dina is heading up to how to create some guidelines or explanations to other users on how to get to the ICANN IT staff the required information they would need to [resource] this and to resolve connectivity problems, work with the vendors, work with other program.

Right now, according to the ticketing process that staff who are running the meetings, they are tasked with submitting these tickets. And what we're going to be working on is how do we create some guidelines or advising users of what kind of information the IT staff need to have on a ticket, so that they can resolve these issues. Next slide.

And these will include – some information could be using Wi-Fi, using a direct link, how close are you to the router, what is the bandwidth issues are you having? Is Adobe giving you limited bandwidth issues? Some other type of things, so the IT staff can

troubleshoot and figure out is it a user error, is it Adobe error, is it something else? Is it Adigo error? And without the information, they can't really follow up and without contact information, so we're working with IT to create a type of form that they could use, that we could have that information so that when a user who may not be in Zoom or maybe others, that they could refer to and send the staff running the meeting the information they need so that they could file a ticket with IT and get things resolved.

So, if anyone else that wants to help work with Dina, please let us know. Dina.

DINA SOLVEIG JALKANEN: All right. So, when I was asked about it a couple of days back, I decided to go talk to the staff and thinking of the guidelines, how useful would they be, would anyone read them, and so on. So, the person on ICANN staff gave some input on the troubleshooting they're working on and just to sum it up briefly, because there's been a lot of back and forth with user and getting the [necessary] information or not getting it, ICANN staff thought that it would be a marvelous idea to include several steps into each of the sessions and one of those steps would basically lead to the form. And ICANN staff is working on the

form, which would collect only the information and directly reach their ticketing.

They wished for the Technology Task Force to have an outreach function here, so basically, let other people know that this form exists, so that small sessions would also have that. That is pretty much it. So, guidelines, do we need them? What do we put there? I think that should be open to the discussion of the Taskforce. What is the missing step do you see in the system because I'm not sure I see one.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Dina, thanks so much. We only have one minute left for Spanish for interpretation, and so we are going to take one quick question and then move on because interpretation is finished. Right, and so we're going to we need to have a break for those. Jolie has put in the chat some questions, but if there's any [quickly] issues, otherwise, we always would like to hear from you what are your technology issues. What are the questions you want answered? What are the topics you want covered? Please let us know, since we want to work for you.

We are open to anyone from other constituencies coming in and chatting with us and talking about their technology issues. We're happy to take them all on but we need to close out because the interpreters and the captioners need a break. So, thanks so

much, all, for coming on here, and sorry if you didn't get your questions answered. But I'm glad, and thanks again for Jolie for putting up the Zoom link and we will get back to everyone later.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you. This meeting has been adjourned.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you to the interpreters and to the Tech Team. Just for those in the room, there's the ICANN FY '19 the second part of the budget discussions, which will be held in room 202 and the cross-community session starts at 10:30 in Ballroom A on level 3. That is on open data and information transparency at ICANN developing avenues forward. So, those are the next sessions. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: If I can, Gisella, the first one about the finance, it's repetition of the one of yesterday and it's mainly for people who were not here yesterday and were still interested in discussing the budget today.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you. So, it shouldn't be Part 2, it should just be repetition. Thank you for the clarification.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]